

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CASE MANAGEMENT COSTS
HEALTH AND WELFARE AGENCY

DECEMBER 15, 1980

FINANCIAL AND PERFORMANCE ACCOUNTABILITY
DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE
STATE OF CALIFORNIA

DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE
SACRAMENTO



December 15, 1980

Honorable Walter W. Stiern, Chairperson
Joint Legislative Budget Committee
c/o Mr. William G. Hamm, Legislative Analyst
925 L Street, Room 650
Sacramento, CA 95814

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CASE MANAGEMENT COSTS, HEALTH AND WELFARE AGENCY

The Department of Finance is pleased to forward this comparative analysis of case management costs for five programs administered by the Health and Welfare Agency. The analysis was requested by the Committee of Conference on the Budget Bill for the 1980-81 fiscal year.

Case management is very individualized depending on the needs of the client. The analysis identifies the primary factor in determining case management costs as the client. As the intensity of the case manager's involvement with the client increases the cost increases. Annual costs range from \$693.69 to \$1,759.06.

If you have any questions, please contact Richard L. Cutting, Chief, Financial and Performance Accountability unit at (916) 322-2985.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Mary Ann Graves".

MARY ANN GRAVES
Director of Finance

2807E

Table of Contents

	<u>Page</u>
Introduction	1
Multipurpose Senior Services Project	3
Regional Centers	3
Adult Protective Services	4
Out-of-Home Care Services for Children	4
Vocational Rehabilitation	4
Caseload Comparisons	5
Staffing	7
Case Management Costs	9
Conclusions	9
Appendix	
I Multipurpose Senior Service Project	
II Regional Center Program	
III Adult Protective Services Program	
IV Out-of-Home Care for Children Program	
V Vocational Rehabilitation	

List of Tables & Exhibits

	<u>Page</u>
Table	
1. Comparison of Case Management Activities by Program	2
2. Average Caseload/Staffing Ratio	5
3. Comparison of Classifications and Salary Scales 1979-80	8
4. Comparative Case Management Costs by Program	10
Exhibit	
A Department of Rehabilitation, Average Open Caseload	6
B Supplemental Report of the Committee of Conference on the Budget Bill	11

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CASE MANAGEMENT COSTS
HEALTH AND WELFARE AGENCY

In accordance with Item 35 of the Supplemental Report of the Committee of Conference on the Budget Bill for the 1980-81 fiscal year, the Department of Finance has prepared a comparative analysis of case management costs for programs administered by the Health and Welfare Agency. Five programs were chosen for this comparison. The programs and the administering agency are:

Multipurpose Senior Services Project (MSSP)
Health and Welfare Agency

Regional Centers
Department of Developmental Services

Adult Protective Services Program
Department of Social Services

Out-of-Home Care for Children Program
Department of Social Services

Vocational Rehabilitation
Department of Rehabilitation

The Department of Mental Health is preparing a report on their cost of case management, and the data will be available January 1981.

For purposes of this analysis of case management costs, we define case management services to exist when a counselor has a continuing responsibility for an individual's well-being. This responsibility does not include legal responsibility which exists for guardianship or conservatorship. Case management would include managing an individual's funds, assisting them in obtaining services, finding lodging, etc., but does not include actual provision of services.

Case management is generally defined in terms of the activities performed. Table 1 presents tasks performed by case managers of the programs compared. Broadly, case management involves identification and assessment of an individual's needs and developing a plan to fill those needs. The coordination of services, ensuring delivery of services, and evaluating services are all a part of case management

The specifics of case management vary by department and program. Some use an interdisciplinary team approach while others assign a caseload to a specific case manager. While the activities involved remain fairly constant across programs, their emphasis varies particularly by type of client served. For instance, with children, the emphasis is on protection and management of financial resources. With adults, the emphasis might be on finances and long-term care. By definition, case management is difficult to measure because of its emphasis on the needs of the individual.

TABLE 1

COMPARISON OF CASE MANAGEMENT
ACTIVITIES BY PROGRAM

	Health and Welfare MSSP	Developmental Services Regional Centers	Social Services		Rehabilitation Vocational Rehabilitation
			Adult Protective Services Program	Out-of-Home Care for Children Program	
Advocacy/Mediation	x	x	x	x	x
Assessment	x	x	x	x	x
Consultation	x	x	x	x	x
Coordination	x	x	x	x	x
Counseling	x	x	x	x	x
Crisis Intervention	x	x			
Discharge				x	x
Evaluation	x	x	x		x
Followup/Monitoring	x	x	x	x	
Information	x	x	x	x	x
Instruction		x			x
Investigation			x	x	x
Planning	x	x	x	x	x
Referral	x	x	x	x	x
Referral to Court/ Law Enforcement		x	x	x	
Selection and Placement	x			x	x
Supervision	x	x	x	x	x
Technical Assistance	x	x	x	x	x
Transportation	x		x	x	x
Other	x	x	x	x	x

Before making comparisons of case management costs, it is necessary to present an overview of the five programs. A description of each program follows:

Multipurpose Senior Services Project (MSSP)

MSSP is a research and development project to serve older persons in jeopardy of institutionalization by providing assistance for independent living. The Health and Welfare Agency administers this program through contracts with a combination of local governments and nonprofit agencies to provide case management services to senior citizens.

The MSSP programs are staffed by:

- Senior Services Counselors who are required to hold a Master of Social Work (MSW) degree or a degree in social work plus additional qualifying experience equivalent to a MSW.
- Nurse Practitioners who are registered nurses (RNs) with additional training to allow them to practice while not under the direction of a physician. They provide routine medical treatment without a physician, including prescribing some medications. They usually work in conjunction with a physician and are involved in primary care.
- Senior Service Aides whose class requires a Bachelor of Arts degree as a minimum qualification.

The staff of a MSSP project work as an interdisciplinary team with each sharing primary responsibility for carrying out portions of the plan to meet client needs.

Regional Centers

The Department of Developmental Services administers this program which serves persons with developmental disabilities. Developmental disability is described as a disability that originates before an individual attains age 18, continues, or can be expected to continue indefinitely, and constitutes a substantial handicap for such individual. It includes mental retardation, cerebral palsy, epilepsy, and autism and similar handicapping conditions. Thus, the group served range from infants to elderly persons.

Developmental Services contracts with 21 private nonprofit organizations to provide services to persons with developmental disabilities. Each regional center develops its own internal structure to meet the needs of its clients. Through its Continuing Care Services Branch, the department also provides case management to approximately 9,000 clients.

Case managers in this program have a number of classifications and salary schedules because of the number of agencies involved. Generally, four classifications are used:

- Senior Counselor which usually requires a Master of Social Work degree and supervises counselors and aides. Case management would be provided to the most difficult clients.

- . Counselors who possess a Bachelor's degree in social work or are Licensed Clinical Social Workers (LCSW).
- . Community Worker, a classification which requires a high school diploma plus work experience.
- . Case Aide that requires a high school education and performs routine tasks such as transporting or setting up appointments for clients.

Adult Protective Services

The Department of Social Services administers the Adult Protective Services Program through county welfare departments and contracts. Within state regulations, counties have wide latitude in the operation of the program. Personnel and salaries are governed by county civil service systems and vary accordingly. Generally, the program is staffed with non-MSWs. Personnel employed will usually possess a Bachelor's degree and some work experience in social work.

Adult Protective Services serves adults who are:

- . Unable to perform activities of daily living at home or arrange for care.
- . Not obtaining or utilizing needed medical or psychiatric care.
- . Living in conditions which present a health or safety hazard.
- . Being deprived of adequate food, clothing or shelter due to inability to manage or to abuse or exploitation by others

Adult means any person 18 years of age or older.

Out-of-Home Care Services for Children

Through county welfare departments and contracts, the Department of Social Services administers this statewide program that provides services for the welfare of children who have been placed or are being considered for placement, and to facilitate their restoration to a permanent family setting or stabilized long-range care.

By regulation, all case managers must possess a Master of Social Work degree.

Vocational Rehabilitation

The Department of Rehabilitation operates this statewide program with employees in 26 district offices. This program serves handicapped individuals who have been defined as any individual who has a physical or mental disability which constitutes a substantial handicap to employment, but to whom vocational rehabilitation services may be expected to render the individual fit to engage in a gainful occupation.

Case manager classifications in this program are:

- . Vocational Rehabilitation Assistant is the recruiting and training class and requires six months' experience with an organized program meeting certain requirements.
- . Vocational Rehabilitation Trainee is also a recruiting and training class and requires graduation from college, preferably with course work in the social and behavioral sciences.
- . Vocational Rehabilitation Counselor, the journey level class, requires two years' experience at the Assistant level or one year at the Trainee level. Alternatives to these minimum qualifications are two years' counseling experience and equivalent to graduation from college, or a Master of Arts or Science degree in rehabilitation counseling.
- . Senior Vocational Rehabilitation Counselor functions in a lead capacity providing guidance and advice to Vocational Rehabilitation Counselors. The class requires two years of experience in the Department of Rehabilitation performing the duties of a Vocational Rehabilitation Counselor.

Caseload Comparisons

Comparisons of average caseload are easy to calculate but extremely difficult to interpret. As can be seen from Table 2, average caseload per worker ranges from 29.57 in the children's program to 84 in rehabilitation. In reality, the average caseload for rehabilitation varies by the clientele as shown in the following Exhibit A:

TABLE 2

AVERAGE CASELOAD/STAFFING RATIO
BY PROGRAM

<u>Program</u>	<u>Caseload</u>
MSSP	29.69
Regional Centers	62.00
Adult Protection Services	57.73
Out-of-Home Care for Children	29.57
Vocational Rehabilitation	84.00

EXHIBIT A

DEPARTMENT OF REHABILITATION
AVERAGE OPEN CASELOAD

<u>Case-Carrier Specialty</u>	<u>Average Open Caseload as of May 31, 1980</u>
ALL CASE-CARRIERS	84
Generalist	88
Trust Fund/Security Fund	94
Alcoholism	90
Blind	81
Deaf	89
Community Mental Health	84
School Youth	101
Developmental Disabilities	81
Counselor-Teacher	41
Industrial Injured	27
Independent Living	56
Severely Disabled	62
Farm Labor	84

Similar patterns hold true for the other programs. Where interdisciplinary teams are used to serve clients, such as in MSSP caseload, ratios become even more meaningless. Caseload appears to be a factor of the type of clientele served. As client involvement increases, that is severity of handicap, such as the multihandicapped, the caseload decreases.

Additionally, caseload is greatly impacted by the definition of an active case. Each program defines an active case differently. Some programs count, as active, clients they telephone once a year while other programs define active in terms of face-to-face contact on a periodic basis; quarterly, monthly, weekly, etc. These disparities in defining an active case further complicate analysis of caseload data and even case management itself.

Staffing

From the program descriptions earlier, it is apparent there is a wide range of qualifications for case managers. Table 3 displays the classifications used and salary scales for these classifications. The staff classifications utilized seem to have a direct relationship to clientele served. Those programs serving clients requiring more intensive supervision, namely MSSP and the Out-of-Home Care for Children, are staffed with the higher classification personnel. These same clientele require more frequent contact, counseling and generally more services. These clients are also more likely to have emergency problems.

The Adult Protective Services and Vocational Rehabilitation programs tend to serve a more stable client in that once a service is arranged, the case manager only monitors progress and is not intensely involved in the client's daily activities.

Regional centers fall in between these two groups in that their clients vary widely in age and disabling conditions. Regional center's, likewise, employ a more diverse staff in terms of classifications and adjust the numbers according to their client mix.

COMPARISON OF CLASSIFICATIONS AND SALARY SCALES
1979-1980

<u>Classification</u>	<u>MSSP^{1/}</u>	<u>Regional Centers</u>	<u>Adult Protective Services</u>	<u>Out-of-Home Care for Children Program</u>	<u>Vocational Rehabilitation</u>
Senior Services Counselor	\$2502				
Nurse Practitioner	2388				
Senior Services Aide	1486				
<u>CCSB</u>					
Supervising Social Worker II		\$1782-2149			
Supervising Social Worker I		1624-1958			
Social Worker		1482-1782			
Social Service Assistant II		906-1081			
<u>Regional Centers^{2/}</u>					
Senior Counselor		1645-1999			
Counselor		1461-1777			
Community Worker III		1142-1388			
Community Worker II		982-1194			
Community Worker I		848-1031			
Case Counselor ^{3/}			\$1968	\$1938	
Senior Vocational Rehabilitation Counselor					\$1624-1958
Vocational Rehabilitation Counselor					1482-1782
Vocational Rehabilitation Trainee					1132-1295
Vocational Rehabilitation Assistant					794-1239
Case Service Assistant					877-1048

^{1/}Monthly average estimated for fiscal year 1981-82.

^{2/}Salary scale for one regional center, other 20 will vary in classification and salary to some degree.

^{3/}Monthly average paid statewide.

Case Management Costs

Comparison of costs for case management is complicated by the differences in recording costs among agencies and because of the lack of consistent time studies of tasks performed. With these restrictions, only gross costs of case management could be compared. Even here there are some caveats:

- . definitions of active cases vary between programs;
- . some activities are subprograms in some agencies and costs had to be accumulated. This presented the possibility that some costs were duplicated or omitted, and
- . except for MSSP which used 1981-82 fiscal year projections, data presented covers the 1979-80 fiscal year and has not been audited. .

Table 4, taking into account the above caveats, displays the cost of case management for the five programs compared. To provide the reader with more detail as to how the costs were compiled, the individual program information is shown in the Appendices.

Table 1 shows that while case management may be defined differently by each program, the activities encompassed are basically the same. The distinguishing factor between the programs is the client served and the time required to complete the activities of case management. The regional centers would support this finding since they serve a clientele that overlaps the other two groups in age and disabling condition and fall in the middle costwise.

Conclusions

1. The review revealed services rendered for children (out-of-home) and older citizens are provided through more involvement by the case manager and at a higher level of professionalism than the adult clients served by Protective Services and Rehabilitation.
2. This report covers the costs related to case management in the various programs described and makes no comment regarding any cost/benefits to the clients served.

TABLE 4

COMPARATIVE CASE MANAGEMENT COSTS
BY PROGRAM

	Health and Welfare MSSP	Developmental Services Regional Centers	Social Services		Rehabilitation Vocational Rehabilitation
			Adult Protective Services Program	Out-of-Home Care for Children Program	
Total Cases	1,900	52,663	14,682	29,882	68,067
Total Case Management Costs	\$3,342,222.00	\$48,696,172.00	\$10,184,828.00	\$41,041,440.00	\$50,797,589.00
Annual Case Management Costs	\$ 1,759.06	\$ 924.68	\$ 693.69	\$ 1,373.45	\$ 746.29
Monthly Case Management Costs	\$ 146.61	\$ 77.06	\$ 57.81	\$ 114.45	\$ 62.19
Average Caseload/ Staffing Ratio	29.69	62.00	57.73	29.57	84.00

Note:

Case management costs here may not agree with department calculations due to differences in methodology. Data for three of the five programs compared was available only as gross costs. Thus, we used gross costs for all programs. For example, salaries and wages include counselor personnel, clerical support and supervisory personnel. If case management includes management of client resources salaries of the personnel involved are included. Support or operating expenses are actual or departmental rate if available, otherwise the statewide rate of 27 percent was used.

Total cases is the average for the year. Case management costs are the result of dividing the total cases into total case management costs.

1/See Appendix I and accompanying notes.

EXHIBIT B

(REVISED)

SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT ON THE COMMITTEE OF CONFERENCE
ON THE BUDGET BILL
CONTAINING AGREED LANGUAGE ON STATEMENTS OF INTENT
OR REQUESTS FOR STUDIES

1980-81 FISCAL YEAR

Item 35 - Secretary of Health and Welfare

The Department of Finance (DOF) shall conduct a comparative analysis of case management costs for programs administered by the Health and Welfare Agency, and report its findings to the Legislature by December 15, 1980.

APPENDIX I
HEALTH AND WELFARE AGENCY
MULTIPURPOSE SENIOR SERVICES PROJECT
(MSSP)

Total Cases			1,900
		FY 80-81 (Estimated) FY 81-82 Reduced by <u>Six Percent</u>	FY 79-80 (Estimated) FY 80-81 Reduced by <u>Six Percent</u>
Case Management Costs:			
Salaries	\$1,683,006	\$1,582,026	\$1,487,104
Support Costs	1,083,000	1,018,020	956,939
Indirect Costs	<u>1,016,500</u>	<u>955,510</u>	<u>898,179</u>
Total Case Management Costs	\$3,782,506	\$3,555,556	\$3,342,222
Annual Case Management Cost	\$ 1,990.79	\$ 1,871.35	\$ 1,759.06
Monthly Case Management Cost	\$ 165.52	\$ 155.96	\$ 146.61

Note:

The MSSP project has not reached full operational levels as of this date. The only year in which the program will be fully operational is fiscal year 1981-82. Data for this year was estimated in response to federal requests for additional information. We have adjusted this data for the annual six percent cost increases used to arrive at the 1981-82 estimate to arrive at estimated fiscal year 1979-80 costs that are used for comparative purposes

Five projects were implemented in the April - June period of 1980 and one each in July, August and September of 1980.

APPENDIX II

DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
REGIONAL CENTER PROGRAM

Active Regional Center Clients^{1/}

Diagnosis, Evaluation	3,708	
Awaiting Services	117	
Receiving All Needed Services	35,544	
Case Management Only	<u>13,294</u>	
Subtotal		52,663
State Hospitals		<u>8,751</u>
Total Active Clients		61,414

Case Management Costs^{1/}

Regional Centers (21) Salaries:		
Case Finding and Identification	\$ 1,834,784	
Case Assessment	8,976,584	
Case Management	15,798,554	
Benefit Payee Services	<u>547,669</u>	
Subtotal Salaries		\$27,157,591
Fringe Benefits @ 20.47% of Salaries		5,559,159
Operating Expense @ 25% of Salaries		<u>6,789,398</u>
Subtotal Regional Center Costs		\$39,506,148
Continuing Care Services Branch (Total Costs)		<u>9,190,024</u>
Total Case Management Costs		\$48,696,172

Annual Case Management Costs

	<u>Annual</u>	<u>Monthly</u>
Total Active Clients (61,414)	\$792.92	\$66.08
Total Active without State Hospitals (52,663)	924.68	77.06
Clients Receiving All Needed Services and Case Management Only (48,838)	997.10	83.09

^{1/}Source: Developmental Disabilities Management Reporting System as of
September 2, 1980

APPENDIX III

DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SERVICES
ADULT PROTECTIVE SERVICES PROGRAM

Total Cases		14,682
Case Management Costs:		
Salaries	$\$1,501,693 \times 4 =$	$\$6,006,772$
Support	$1,043,712 \times 4 =$	$4,174,848$
Direct	$802 \times 4 =$	<u>3,208</u>
Total Case Management Costs		\$10,184,828
Annual Case Management Cost		\$ 693.69
Monthly Case Management Cost		\$ 57.81

Source: Service Expenditure and Staffing Report, January - March 1980, dated July 23, 1980, Department of Social Services, Table 7.

APPENDIX IV

DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SERVICES
OUT-OF-HOME CARE FOR CHILDREN PROGRAM

Total Cases		29,882
Case Management Costs:		
Salaries	$\$5,874,231 \times 4 =$	$\$23,496,924$
Support	$4,285,581 \times 4 =$	$17,142,324$
Direct	$100,548 \times 4 =$	<u>$402,192$</u>
Total Case Management Costs	$\$10,260,360 \times 4 =$	$\$41,041,440$
Annual Case Management Cost		$\$ 1,373.45$
Monthly Case Management Cost		$\$ 114.45$

Source: Service Expenditure and Staffing Report, January - March 1980, dated July 23, 1980, Department of Social Services, Table 8.

APPENDIX V

DEPARTMENT OF REHABILITATION
VOCATIONAL REHABILITATION

Total Active Cases Managed ^{1/}		68,067
Case Management Costs:		
Total Salaries for Case Carriers ^{2/}	\$30,057,745	
Fringe Benefits @ 29% of Salaries	8,716,746	
Operating Expenses @ 27% of Salaries	8,115,591	
Indirect Costs @ 13% of Salaries ^{3/}	3,907,507	
Total Case Management Costs		\$50,797,589
Annual Case Management Costs		\$ 746.29
Monthly Case Management Costs		\$ 62.19

^{1/}Report PDD 80-8-8, September 24, 1980

^{2/}Fiscal Year 1979-80, Schedule 8

^{3/}Indirect Cost Negotiation Agreement, dated May 7, 1979